



UNIVERSITY  
OF ABERDEEN

SCHOOL OF DIVINITY, HISTORY AND PHILOSOPHY

**ACADEMIC SESSION 2018-2019**

**HA5033 - CONNOISSEURSHIP**

**15 Credit 11 week course**

**PLEASE NOTE CAREFULLY:**

The full set of school regulations and procedures is contained in the **Postgraduate Student Handbook** which is available online at your [MyAberdeen](#) page. Students are expected to familiarise themselves not only with the contents of this leaflet but also with the contents of the Handbook. Therefore, ignorance of the contents of the Handbook will not excuse the breach of any school regulation or procedure.

**You must familiarise yourself with this important information at the earliest opportunity.**

**COURSE CO-ORDINATOR/COURSE TEAM**

Course Co-ordinator: John Gash (Room CB406)

Email: [j.gash@abdn.ac.uk](mailto:j.gash@abdn.ac.uk)

Dr Aaron Thom (Room CB201)

Email: [aaron.thom@abdn.ac.uk](mailto:aaron.thom@abdn.ac.uk)

**Discipline Administration:**

Mrs Kathleen Brebner

50-52 College Bounds

Room CB001

01224 273733

[history-art@abdn.ac.uk](mailto:history-art@abdn.ac.uk)

Students are asked to make themselves familiar with the information on key university policies, which is available on MyAberdeen (<https://abdn.blackboard.com/bbcswebdav/institution/Policies>).

These policies are relevant to all students and will be useful throughout your studies. They contain important information, including what to do if you are absent, how to raise an appeal or a complaint, and explain why the University takes your feedback seriously.

These institutional policies should be read in conjunction with the course guide, in which School specific policies are detailed. Further information can be found on the [University's Infohub webpage](#) or by visiting the Infohub.

## TIMETABLE

Classes are in CB203 from 9.15 a.m. to 11.00 a.m. on Mondays, with the exception of one additional one to view a Canaletto painting in the University's collection on the afternoon of Wednesday 24th October.

Students can view their university timetable at

<http://www.abdn.ac.uk/infohub/study/timetables-550.php>

## COURSE DESCRIPTION

The course consists of eleven seminars, for each of which, except the first one, the whole class will be expected to do preparatory study. You are also strongly encouraged to visit galleries in Scotland to see works that will be discussed in the course: e.g. The National Gallery of Scotland, Edinburgh (Titian's *Three Ages of Man*; David Wilkie, or Jean-Pierre Danloux: *The Skating Minister*; Leonardo da Vinci (?): *The Madonna of the Yarn-Winder*; Rembrandt (?): *Portrait of a Woman*, 1634); Perth Museum and Art Gallery (Anon: *Christ Displaying his Wounds*); Glasgow Museum and Art Gallery, Kelvingrove (Giorgione/Titian/Sebastiano: *Christ and the Adulteress*).

## INTENDED AIMS AND LEARNING OUTCOMES

### COURSE AIMS

The course seeks to introduce students to the aims, theory and practice of connoisseurship as a distinct branch of Art History that concentrates primarily on the evidence (of authorship, school, period, quality and authenticity) provided by art objects themselves rather than by written documents. It is concerned with traditional theories and methods of connoisseurship from Jonathan Richardson in the eighteenth century, and Giovanni Morelli in the nineteenth, through to modern scientific procedures for examining paintings, such as SEMs (Scanning Electron Microscopes), x-radiography, infra-red reflectography, and Raman microscopy. It is intended that this course should help to prepare students for a career in which direct contact with art-objects is central, such as working in a public or commercial gallery, or in an auction house.

**LEARNING OUTCOMES**

1. Students will develop the ability to attribute works of art to particular artists by learning about attributional techniques in class.
2. Students will enhance their skills of attribution through private reading and through examining paintings and other works of art in the original as well as in high-quality reproductions.
3. Students will further develop their attribution skills, by visiting galleries to see, in situ, works discussed in class, to be reflected in the 4,000 word course essay.
4. Students will develop a connoisseurial ability (specialist knowledge about the appearance, quality and status of works of art, including whether they are originals, copies, or fakes), to be reflected in the 4,000 word course essay.

They should aim to see some of the works discussed in the seminars in the original, in Scottish galleries such as the National Gallery, Edinburgh, the Glasgow Museum and Art Gallery, Kelvingrove, the Perth Museum and Art Gallery, The McManus Gallery, Dundee, Scone Palace (near Perth), and the National Gallery, London.

**EXHIBITION**

You are strongly encouraged to visit the exhibition 'Rembrandt: Britain's Discovery of the Master' at the Royal Scottish Academy, Edinburgh till October 14th.

## SEMINAR PROGRAMME

### WEEK 1

**Monday 10 September, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

Deceptions and Discoveries: Scientific Aids to Connoisseurship

### WEEK 2

**Monday 17 September, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

Giovanni Morelli's method of 'scientific' connoisseurship

### WEEK 3

**Monday 24 September, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

Leonardo da Vinci and his Workshop. Can we tell who painted what?

### WEEK 4

**Monday 1 October, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

The Giorgione-Titian Conundrum

### WEEK 5

**Monday 8 October, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

Caravaggio and his Followers: some cases of disputed or uncertain attribution: *Portrait of Monsignor Maffeo Barberini* (Corsini Collection, Florence); *Narcissus* (Galleria Nazionale di Palazzo Barberini, Rome); *The Toothpuller* (Pitti Gallery, Florence); *Judith beheading Holofernes* (Eric Turquin Gallery, Paris); *The Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew* (Royal Collection, Hampton Court); *Christ displaying his Wounds* (Perth Museum and Art Gallery, Scotland); *The Incredulity of Saint Thomas* (Wrotham Park); *Apollo and Hyacinth* (Musée Thomas Henry, Cherbourg); *St. John the Baptist* (Kunstmuseum, Basel); *The Denial of Saint Peter* (Scone Palace).

### WEEK 6

**Monday 15 October, CB 203, 9.15 a.m.-11 a.m.**

Rembrandt: The Master and his Workshop. What is an Original?

**WEEK 7****Monday 22 October, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

Jonathan Richardson the Elder and Younger: Eighteenth-Century Pioneers of Connoisseurship in England

**Wednesday 24 October, 2.10 p.m. Meet by the Lion and Unicorn outside the King's College Conference Centre.**

A chance to see Antonio Canaletto's *Capriccio with Roman Ruins and a Bishop's Tomb* in the University collection.

**WEEK 8****Monday 29 October, CB 203, 9.15 a.m. - 11 a.m.**

Bernard Berenson and the Cult of the Connoisseur

**WEEK 9****Monday 5 November, CB 203, 9.15-11 a.m.**

*The Skating Minister* in Edinburgh: Raeburn or Danloux?

**WEEK 10****Monday 12 November, CB 203, 9.15–11 a.m.**

Four 20<sup>th</sup>-century Forgers: Han van Meegeren, Tom Keating, Eric Hebborn and Shaun Greenhalgh (The Bolton Forger). For this class you will each be asked to prepare a ten-minute presentation on one of the above forgers, or another one of your choice (which you should clear in advance with John Gash).

Depending on the number of students on the course, some presentations may be held over till the same time in the following week, **Monday 19 November**.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### General

See essays on *Connoisseurship* (by Enrico Castelnuovo, Jaynie Anderson, Stephen Little, and S.N. Chaturvedi) and on *Forgery* (by David Phillips) [*sub voce*] in *The Macmillan/Grove Dictionary of Art* (ed. Jane Turner) (32 vols.)

Carol Gibson-Wood, *Studies in the Theory of Connoisseurship from Vasari to Morelli*, 1988.

John Pope-Hennessy, *Learning to Look: An Autobiography*, 1991.

Andrew W. Brainerd, *On Connoisseurship and Reason in the Authentication of Art*.

*Fake?: The Art of Deception*, ed. Mark Jones (with Paul Craddock and Nicolas Barker), British Museum Publications, London, 1990.

Philip Mould, *The Art Detective* (2010); and his earlier books *Sleuth: The Amazing Quest for Lost Art Treasures*, 2009; and *Sleepers*.

Max. J. Friedlaender, *On Art and Connoisseurship*, 1943

Brian Sewell's two-volume autobiography, *Outsider and Outsider II*

### Scientific aids to connoisseurship

Marjorie E. Wieseman: *A Closer Look. Deceptions and Discoveries*, National Gallery/Yale, 2010 (a few copies in Library)

National Gallery, London, DVD: *Close Examination. Fakes, Mistakes and Discoveries*. Available from the Department (see JG if you wish to borrow).

Jehane Ragai, *The Scientist and the Forger: Insights into the Scientific Detection of Forgery*, Imperial College Press, London, 2015.

### Giovanni Morelli

Giovanni Morelli: *Italian Painters: Critical Studies of their Works, 1893-1900* (contains all the major writings)

Eric Fernie: Section on Morelli and extract from *Italian Painters in Art History and its Methods: A Critical Anthology*, London 1995, pp.103-115.

Edgar Wind: section on Morelli in *Art and Anarchy*, London, 1963, pp.32-51.

Richard Wollheim: 'Giovanni Morelli and the Origins of Scientific Connoisseurship' in *On Art and Mind: Essays and Lectures*, London, 1973.

Carlo Ginzburg: 'Morelli, Freud and Sherlock Holmes: Clues and Scientific Method' *History Workshop Journal*, no. 9, Spring, 1980, pp.5-36

Luke Uglow: 'Giovanni Morelli and his friend Giorgione: Connoisseurship, Science and Irony', *Journal of Art Historiography*, Number 11, December 2014

### **Leonardo da Vinci**

Apart from books on Leonardo by Kenneth Clark, Martin Kemp, Carlo Pedretti, and many more (including the catalogue of the 1989 Leonardo exhibition at the Hayward Gallery, London), see especially the catalogue of the more recent Leonardo exhibition at the National Gallery, London: *Leonardo da Vinci. Painter at the Court of Milan*, by Luke Syson with Larry Keith, 2011, and the National Gallery Technical Bulletin vol.32: *Leonardo da Vinci: Pupil, Painter and Master*, available at [www.nationalgallery.org.uk/technical-bulletin/](http://www.nationalgallery.org.uk/technical-bulletin/)

### **The Giorgione-Titian Debate**

On Giorgione, see especially, Jaynie Anderson, *Giorgione, The Painter of 'Poetic Brevity', including Catalogue Raisonné*, 1997. See also, T. Pignatti, *Giorgione*, London 1971; and V. Lilli and P. Zampetti, *L'Opera Completa di Giorgione*, Milan 1978. Most recently, see *In the Age of Giorgione*, by Simone Facchinetti and Arturo Galansino, exhibition catalogue, The Royal Academy of Arts, London, 2016 (Reviewed by Tom Nichols, *The Burlington Magazine*, June 2016).

For Titian, see books by Charles Hope, H. Wethey, and, more recently, Peter Humfrey. For the modern drive to attribute the Louvre *Concert Champêtre* to Titian, see, esp., this latter and the exhibition catalogue, *Le siècle de Titien: L'âge d'or de la peinture à Venise*, Paris, Grand Palais, 1993.

On the Glasgow *Christ and the Woman taken in Adultery* see *The Age of Titian*, exhibition catalogue, ed. P. Humfrey etc., National Galleries of Scotland 2004, pp.80-



2; *Glasgow Museums: the Italian Paintings*, by Peter Humfrey, London and Glasgow, 2012; and *In the Age of Giorgione* (see above) – although none of these support the older attribution to Giorgione espoused by George Martin Richter, Giles Robertson, and Ellis Waterhouse, among others.

On the Kingston-Lacy *Judgment of Solomon*, now widely attributed to Sebastiano del Piombo, see Michael Hirst, *Sebastiano del Piombo*; and *The Genius of Venice*, exhib. cat., Royal Academy of Arts, London, 1983, pp. 210-11 and plates 56-7.

Luke Uglow: 'Giovanni Morelli and his friend Giorgione: Connoisseurship, Science and Irony', *Journal of Art Historiography*, Number 11, December 2014

### **Caravaggio/Followers**

Books on Caravaggio by Hibbard, Friedlaender, Moir, Gash, Langdon, Puglisi, Cinotti, Spike, Schütze etc.

On Followers, see Richard Spear, *Caravaggio and his Followers*, 1971/5, Alfred Moir, *The Italian Followers of Caravaggio*, 1967, and Benedict Nicholson, *Caravaggism in Europe*, 3 vols., 1990, as well as the more recent two-volume Italian study (with good colour illustrations): *I Caravaggeschi. Percorsi e protagonisti*, ed. A. Zuccari, 2010.

On technical aspects of Caravaggio, see: Keith Christiansen: 'Caravaggio and "l'esempio davanti del naturale"', *Art Bulletin*, 68, 1986, pp.421-45, and Mina Gregori (ed.), *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: come nascono i capolavori*, exhibition catalogue, Florence-Rome, 1991-2.

On *Narcissus* see *Caravaggio and his Italian Followers from the Collections of the Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica di Roma*, exh. cat., Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford., Conn., 1998, pp.60-63; and Gianni Papi, *Spadarino*, Soncino, 2003.

For *The Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew*, see *The Art of Italy in the Royal Collection: Renaissance and Baroque*, ed. Lucy Whitaker and Martin Clayton, exhib. cat., 2007, pp.265-9.

For *The Toothpuller*, see both ed. Gregori, and K. Christiansen, above, and J.Gash: 'The Caravaggesque Toothpuller', in *Others and Outcasts in Early Modern Europe: Picturing the Social Margins*, ed. Tom Nichols, Ashgate (Aldershot), 2007, pp.133-155.

For the Perth *Christ* see John Gash, 'A Caravaggesque 'Christ' in Scotland, *The Burlington Magazine*, no. 1279, vol. CLI, October 2009, pp.682-90; *Caravaggio's Friends and Foes*, exhibition catalogue, Whitfield Fine Art, London, 2010 (copy available from JG); Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine website.

For the attribution of the Basel *St. John* to Maïno, see the catalogue (in Spanish and English) of the Maïno exhibition at the Prado in 2009, and Peter Cherry's review of it in *The Burlington Magazine*, February 2010.

For the Cherbourg *Apollo and Hyacinth*, consult John Gash, who has just prepared an article on it.

For the version of Gerard Seghers' *Denial of Saint Peter* in Scone Palace, see Benedict Nicolson: 'Gerard Seghers and the Denial of St. Peter', *The Burlington Magazine*, 113, no.819, June 1971, pp.304-08, and Dorothea Bieneck, *Gerard Seghers*, 1992 (in German).

For the Wrotham Park *Incredulity of Saint Thomas*, see John Gash, 'Spadarino's *Doubting Thomas* Rediscovered', *The Burlington Magazine*, October 2015, pp.678-81.

For the controversy surrounding the attribution of George de La Tour's *Fortuneteller* in the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York (one of the essay topics) see: the articles by Christopher WRIGHT and Diana de MARLY in *The Connoisseur*, Sept. 1980; Dec. 1980; Jan. 1981. Note also the correspondence in *The Burlington Magazine*, July, Aug. & Sept. 1981 - and C.WRIGHT, returning, bruised, to the counter-attack in *The Art of the Forger*, 1984. More recently, Brian Sewell has once again raised doubts about the attribution in volume 2 of his autobiography, *Outsider II*, 2012.

### **Rembrandt and his Workshop**

Good introductions are provided by:-

J.Rosenberg, *Rembrandt : Life and Work*, 1964, 759.492 Rem; Kenneth Clark, *An Introduction to Rembrandt*, 1978; M. Kitson, *Rembrandt*; Christopher White, *Rembrandt*; and, especially, Gary Schwarz, *Rembrandt : his life, his Paintings*, 1985/91, 759.492 Rem, and Ernst van de Wetering, *Rembrandt: The Painter Thinking*, 2016.

The former standard catalogue of the *Complete paintings* is by A. Bredius, revised H. Gerson.

But, more importantly, see the 4 first volumes (1982; 1986; 1989 and 2006) of *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*, ed. J. Bruyn (and the 2006 vol. on the self-portraits by Ernst van de Wetering. See *Apollo*, Dec. 2006, pp.28-31 for a discussion of the latter). These cover the period 1625-42, plus the self-portraits. This important reference work has, however, provoked great controversy over its proposed de-attribution of large numbers of paintings traditionally accepted as by Rembrandt. The controversy is discussed in the editorial of the MAY 1992 issue of *The Burlington Magazine*, and in J. Gash, "Rembrandt or Not ?", *Art in America*, January 1993, pp. 57-69, and 127 (Copy available in QML, catalogued under *Art in America*; or from John Gash).

Issues of attribution, along with others relating to Rembrandt's life, working procedures, and technique are further explored in the catalogues of the major exhibition held in Berlin, Amsterdam and London in 1991/2:- *Rembrandt: the Master and his Workshop*, 2 vols (*Paintings*, ed. C. Brown, J. Kelch & P. van Thiel; and *Drawings and Etchings*, ed. H. Bevers, P. Schatborn & B. Welzel. 759.492 Rem).

Further discussion of attribution issues, can be found in: Christopher Brown, 'Rembrandt's Reassessed', *Apollo*, Dec. 2006, pp. 54-61; Christopher Brown, 'the Rembrandt Year', *The Burlington Magazine*, Feb. 2007, pp. 104-8; Ernst van der Wetering, 'Connoisseurship and Rembrandt's paintings: new directions in the Rembrandt Research Project, part II', *The Burlington Magazine*, Feb. 2008, pp.83-90; and the electronic book by Catherine B. Scallen *Rembrandt, reputation, and the practice of connoisseurship*, Amsterdam, c.2004.

Recently, Ernst van de Wetering has produced a detailed personal review of all the paintings in the Corpus volumes: *Rembrandt's Paintings Revisited: A Complete Survey*, 2014, as the concluding volume of *A Corpus of Rembrandt Paintings*. [This is an essential study tool.](#)

Rembrandt's technique is extensively discussed in the National Gallery exhibition catalogue, *Art in the Making: Rembrandt*, 1988-9, by D. BOMFORD, etc. (and recent, revised, ed.). Video available from J.G.

See also the catalogue of the recent Rembrandt exhibition at the National Gallery, London: *Rembrandt: The Late Works*, ed. Jonathan Bikker, 2014.

### **Jonathan Richardson (the Elder and Younger)**

Carol Gibson-Wood, *Studies in the Theory of Connoisseurship from Vasari to Morelli*, 1988.

Carol Gibson-Wood, *Jonathan Richardson: Art Theorist of the English Enlightenment*, Yale University Press, 2000 (copy available from JG as well as in Library)

See also the following early printed volumes under the name of Jonathan Richardson the Elder (1665-1745), but in several cases assisted by his son, also Jonathan. They are available in Special Collections and Archives in the Sir Duncan Rice Library, but an appointment to read them will need to be made in advance. You can also read them on line:-

Jonathan Richardson, *An Account of some of the Statues, Bas-reliefs, Drawings and Pictures in Italy &c, with Remarks*, London 1722.

Jonathan Richardson, *The Works of Mr. Jonathan Richardson, consisting of I: The Theory of Painting, II: Essay on the Art of Criticism so far as it relates to Painting, III: The Science of a Connoisseur*, London 1773.

### **Canaletto**

In connection with our viewing of Canaletto's *Capriccio with Roman Ruins and a Bishop's Tomb*, see John Gash and Charles Beddington: 'Paintings by Canaletto and his Father in Aberdeen University', *The Burlington Magazine*, no. 1377 Vol. CLIX, December 2017, pp.976-981. Digital copy available on request from JG.

### **Bernard Berenson**

Apart from Berenson's own writings (especially *The Italian Painters of the Renaissance* and *The Italian Pictures of the Renaissance* (lists)), see:

Kenneth Clark's autobiography, *Another Part of the Wood*, 1974; Ernest Samuels' biographies of Berenson, *The Making of a Connoisseur*, 1979, and *The Making of a Legend*, 1987 (with Jayne Samuels); the biography of him by his pupil John Walker, a book on Berenson's art dealer friend, Duveen, by Behram, entitled simply *Duveen* (1951); and David Alan Brown, *Berenson and the Connoisseurship of Italian painting: a handbook of the exhibition*, 1979. See also, Colin Simpson, *The Partnership: the Secret Association of Bernard Berenson and Joseph Duveen*; and a review of both

Samuels and Simpson, by Francis Haskell, in *The Times Literary Supplement*, June 5, 1987, pp.595-6.

### **THE SKATING MINISTER IN THE NATIONAL GALLERY OF SCOTLAND**

The key works are:

Stephen Lloyd, 'Elegant and graceful attitudes': the painter of the 'Skating minister', *The Burlington Magazine*, July 2005, pp. 474-486, which seeks to reattribute the picture from Raeburn to Henri-Pierre Danloux, and Duncan Thompson, 'Raeburn Revisited: *The Skating Minister*', in *The Burlington Magazine*, March 2007, pp.185-189, which reattributes it once more to Raeburn.

There is also a small National Gallery of Scotland book on the picture by Duncan Thompson and Lynne Gladstone-Millar: *The Skating Minister: The Story Behind the Painting*, 2004.

Stephen Lloyd once again argues for Danloux in *Henry Raeburn: Content, Reception and Reputation*, ed. by Vicky Coltman and Stephen Lloyd, Edinburgh, 2012. His view is supported by Richard Green in his review of the book in *The Burlington Magazine*, January 2014, pp. 35-36.

### **Han van Meegeren, Eric Hebborn, Tom Keating and Shaun Greenhalgh**

Magnus Magnusson, *Fakers, Forgers & Phoneys*, 2006 (deals with van Meegeren and Tom Keating among others)

Jonathan Lopez, 'Van Meegeren's early Vermeers', *Apollo*, July-August 2008

Frank Wynne: *I was Vermeer: The Forger who swindled the Nazis*.

Christopher Wright, *The Art of the Forger*, 1984, though mainly (and unconvincingly) about alleged fakes of Georges de La Tour, touches upon van Meegeren.

Eric Hebborn's *Master Faker: The Forging of an Artist*, 1988/91, is a riveting autobiography.

For Shaun Greenhalgh, the 'Bolton forger' of sculpture and painting, and *conceivably* also of the 'Leonardo' *Bella Principessa* drawing, see his recent autobiography: *A Forger's Tale. Confessions of the Bolton Forger*, London, 2017.

## ASSESSMENT

Assessment is through **one essay of 4,000 words (including footnotes)** [90%] from the list of topics provided below and participation in class through seminar talks and contribution to discussion, [10%]. Students should note that they will be penalised for work which is either too short or too long. For this essay, the acceptable margin below or above the word count is 5%.

To view the CGS Descriptors please go to **MyAberdeen- Organisations-Divinity, History, & Philosophy Student Information for Taught Postgraduates**. The link to the CGS Descriptors is on the left hand menu.

## ESSAY TITLES

**Write an essay of 4000 words on one of the following topics. To be handed in to CB008 by 3.00pm on Wednesday 21 November 2018:**

1. Attempt to arrive at an attribution for the following three pictures traditionally ascribed to Giorgione:- *The Concert Champêtre* (Musée du Louvre, Paris); *Christ and the Woman taken in Adultery* (Glasgow Museum and Art Gallery, Kelvingrove); *The Judgment of Solomon* (National Trust, Kingston Lacy, Dorset). You should seek to explain your attributional method in some detail, indicating the extent to which your approach follows, or differs from, those of previous connoisseurs [of Giorgione, but also more generally].
2. Who painted the *Madonna Litta*?
3. Assess the arguments for and against attributing **four** of the following seven pictures to Caravaggio:- *Portrait of Monsignor Maffeo Barberini* (Corsini Gallery, Florence); *Narcissus* (Galleria Nazionale, Palazzo Barberini, Rome); *The Toothpuller* (Pitti Gallery, Florence); *The Sacrifice of Isaac* (formerly Barbara Piasecka Johnson Collection, Princeton); *The Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew* (Royal Collection); *The Vision of Saint Jerome* (Art Museum, Worcester, Massachusetts); *Judith beheading Holofernes* (Galerie Eric Turquin, Paris). You should seek to explain your attributional methods in some detail, highlighting when, and for what reasons, differing factors come into play.
4. Discuss the problematic attributions of the following four Caravaggesque paintings: *Christ displaying his Wounds* (Perth Museum and Art Gallery, Scotland); *Apollo and Hyacinth* (Musée Thomas Henry, Cherbourg); *Saint John the Baptist* (Kunstmuseum, Basel); *The Incredulity of Saint Thomas* (Wrotham Park).
5. What are the similarities and differences between Jonathan Richardson the Elder and Giovanni Morelli's methods of 'scientific' attribution? As part of your answer you should consider whether their concepts of science, and consequently their

methodologies, were circumscribed by the scientific and philosophical discourse of their own day.

6. Who painted *The Skating Minister* in the National Gallery of Scotland? Give detailed reasons and explain your methodology.
7. Is the faker's success predicated on the blindness of the connoisseur? Discuss with reference to *at least two* fakers.
8. How decisive can modern scientific methods of analysis be in clinching an attribution?
9. Assess in detail the evidence for and against attributing *The Fortune Teller* in the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, to Georges de La Tour?
10. How would you distinguish the style and technique of Canaletto from those of his nephew, Bernardo Bellotto?

### **ASSESSMENT DEADLINES**

Essay to be submitted by 3.00pm on Wednesday, 21st November 2018.

## SUBMISSION ARRANGEMENTS

Submit **one paper copy** (cover sheet required) to the **drop boxes in CB008 in 50-52 College Bounds** and **one official electronic copy** to TurnitinUK via [MyAberdeen](#). Both copies to be submitted by 3.00pm on the due date.

**Paper Copy:** One paper copy, typed and double spaced, together with an **Assessment cover sheet** – this should have your ID number **clearly** written on the cover sheet, with **NO** name or signature but **EVERYTHING ELSE** completed, including tutor's name – and should be delivered to the drop boxes in CB008, 50-52 College Bounds.

**Electronic Copy:** One copy submitted through TurnitinUK via [MyAberdeen](#). (for instructions please see <http://www.abdn.ac.uk/eLearning/turnitinuk/students/> ) Students are asked to retain the TurnitinUK receipt so they are able to provide proof of submission at a later date if required.

In advance of uploading, please save the assignment with your student ID number listed in the filename, i.e. **59999999 HA5033 Essay 1**.

When asked to enter a title for the assignment, please enter a title identical to the name of your saved assignment, i.e. **59999999 HA5033 Essay 1**.

Both copies to be submitted by 3.00pm on the due date.

**Please note: Failure to submit both an electronic copy to TurnitinUK, and an identical paper copy, will result in a deduction of marks.**

**Failure to submit to TurnitinUK will result in a zero mark.**

John Gash

June 2018