The Irish and Scottish Diasporas in Historical Context: A Bibliography of Comparative and Transnational Studies

INTRODUCTION:

The following bibliography contains a selection of historical studies of the overseas Irish and Scottish communities that are inspired by comparative and transnational ("diasporic") approaches. Comparative approaches "examine specific similarities and differences in the experiences of similar migrants who have settled in different nations or national regions". Diasporic approaches, in contrast, "seek to transcend the nation-state as the primary unit of historical analysis, searching for reciprocal interactions and the sensibilities they nurture among globally scattered communities". This can involve exploring movement and interaction between the home country and overseas destinations, as well as interconnections among areas of overseas settlement.

This literature has emerged as part of a broader trend towards the "internationalizing" of historical enquiry in recent years. In the case of Irish studies, Donald Akenson’s sustained critique of Irish American scholarship for its national insularity has served as an important catalyst for debate. As Kevin Kenny explains: "Given that Irish migration was a genuinely global phenomenon … it has become increasingly clear that the story of the Irish in one part of the world can no longer be told without reference to the Irish elsewhere". Comparative and transnational approaches are less well-developed in the Scottish literature. According to one critic, "[d]espite the fact that Scots played a significantly large role running Britain’s nineteenth-century empire and were instrumental in industrialization – arguably the most important world-historical process – Scottish studies have for the most part remained a piecemeal affair. Concerned more with people than with process, the existing scholarship has not yet connected itself to the growing historical fields of internationalization and globalization". The works included in this bibliography reflect the existence of an expanding body of literature to contradict this statement.

The bibliography presented here is not exhaustive. Instead, through the inclusion of excerpts from scholarly book reviews and journal abstracts, it is designed to provide an introduction to some of the ideas that are motivating and driving historical research in the fields of Irish and Scottish studies at this time.


BIBLIOGRAPHIC LINKS:

Numerous on-line bibliographies dealing more generally with overseas Irish and Scottish communities can be found at the following links:

“The Irish Abroad: USA, Britain and Australia”, Irish Studies, University of Melbourne
http://www.history.unimelb.edu.au/irish/Website12.htm#abroad

“The Irish in… Africa, America, Antarctica, Australia, Britain, Canada, Central America, Europe, India, New Zealand, South America”, The British Library
http://www.bl.uk/collections/britirish/diasporairishin.html

“The Irish in Mexico: An Annotated Bibliography”, Irishdiaspora.net, University of Leeds
http://ics.leeds.ac.uk/papers/vp01.cfm?outfit=ids&requesttimeout=500&folder=160&paper=161

“The Irish in South America – An Annotated Bibliography Part 1”, Irishdiaspora.net, University of Leeds
http://ics.leeds.ac.uk/papers/vp01.cfm?outfit=ids&requesttimeout=500&folder=9&paper=22

“The Irish in South America – An Annotated Bibliography Part II”, Irishdiaspora.net, University of Leeds
http://ics.leeds.ac.uk/papers/vp01.cfm?outfit=ids&requesttimeout=500&folder=9&paper=157

“The Orange Order: Militant Protestantism and Anti-Catholicism: A Bibliographical Essay”, Irishdiaspora.net, University of Leeds
http://ics.leeds.ac.uk/papers/vp01.cfm?outfit=ids&requesttimeout=500&folder=16&paper=19

“The Irish in Britain, 1750-1922”, Irishdiaspora.net, University of Leeds
http://ics.leeds.ac.uk/papers/vp01.cfm?outfit=ids&requesttimeout=500&folder=15&paper=20

“A Study of the existing sources of information and analysis about Irish emigrants and Irish communities abroad”, Bronwen Walter, Anglia Polytechnic University (see the bibliography at the end of this document which focuses on the post-1945 period)
“Immigration and the Ulster-Scots Diaspora”, Institute of Ulster-Scots Studies, University of Ulster
http://www.arts.ulster.ac.uk/ulsterscots/research/biblio9.html

“Online Bibliography of Material Relating to the Irish in Early Modern Europe” (under construction), The Irish in Europe Project, Department of Modern History, National University of Ireland, Maynooth.
http://www.irishineurope.com/resources.html

“Irish Mercantile Networks in the Low Countries”, Centre for Irish-Scottish and Comparative Studies, Trinity College, Dublin.
http://www.tcd.ie/CISS/MerNet/bibliography.php

“The Irish in Latin America and Iberia: A Bibliography”, Society for Irish Latin American Studies
http://irishargentine.org/bibliography.htm

“Irish History Online”, the Irish component of the Royal Historical Society’s online “Bibliography of British and Irish History”, is developing a substantial Irish Diaspora component
http://www.irishhistoryonline.ie

“Transatlantic Reading List: A Bibliography Compiled by Star Members”, The STAR Project, University of Edinburgh
http://www.star.ac.uk/Archive/Resources/Reading_List.html

BIBLIOGRAPHY:

Akenson, Donald H., The Irish Diaspora: A Primer, (Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen’s University of Belfast; and Toronto: P.D. Meany, 1993).

"Akenson's revisionist history of the Irish diaspora is divided into two sections. The first outlines what he sees as the 'known' facts of the worldwide dispersal of the Irish from their homeland in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The second consists of a discussion of what Akenson sees as the 'unknowns' in Irish diaspora studies, especially the nature of overall Irish emigration to North America. ... Here he dissects what he considers to be the major errors found in recent studies of Irish Americans, accusing these studies of being fundamentally 'racist' in their exclusion of Protestants from consideration in Irish immigration studies and 'irresponsible' in their refusal to place American Irish immigration history into the context of the geographically diverse movement of the Irish to all the frontier regions of the British Empire" [From the review by Janet Dolan in the International Migration Review, 29 (1995), 275-276].

"Akenson's scholarly analysis results in his conclusion that 'not only were there no major behavior differences between Catholics and Protestants that stemmed from cultural factors, but there was also strong positive evidence for actual and demonstrable similarity and, indeed, near identity. When systematically tested in various laboratories, the behavior of Irish Protestants and Irish Catholics was fundamentally the same' (p. 108). While of limited interest to a reader of popular literature, Small Differences makes a considerable contribution to scholarly Irish historiography. It should prove to be an impetus for additional reflection and reassessment of long held beliefs regarding Irish Protestants and Irish Catholics" [From the review by Denis Pahl in the International Migration Review, 22 (1988), 666-667].


"Akenson explores the significance of his study. For him this lies in the rural settlement and the farming success of the Irish, both Catholic and Protestant. This casts doubt, he suggests, on the prevailing view in the United States that Irish immigrants, predominantly Catholic, settled in urban centers because they lacked the skills as well as the funds to become farmers, and on the prevailing view in Ireland that nineteenth century Irish Catholics and Protestants were culturally far different. 'The Irish-Catholic migrant to the New World', he concludes, 'was much quicker, more technologically adaptive, more economically alert, and much less circumscribed by putative cultural limits inherited from the Old Country than is usually believed' " [From the review by Jean Burnet in the International Migration Review, 20 (1986), 1061-1062].


"Given the current trend toward 'internationalizing' our study of history (both the American Historical Review and the Journal of American History have recently focused attention on this subject), one might imagine that studies of the Irish diaspora would have begun to compare their subjects' pre- and post-emigration lives more fully. Those who study the seventeenth and eighteenth-century 'Atlantic World', for example, have produced a number of sophisticated and influential monographs that cross national boundaries, but this trend has had little impact on historians of immigration, the vast majority of whom study the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. ... Historians, justifiably skeptical about claims that contemporary immigrants are so different from their predecessors, have been reluctant to jump onto the transnational bandwagon. Those interested in immigration and ethnicity have instead focused on issues such as 'whiteness' (exemplified by Noel Ignatiev's provocative How the Irish Became White), nativism, and other aspects of cultural history. Research on the Irish elsewhere has followed the same trends. ... Even the appearance of a six-book series entitled 'The Irish World Wide', while significant, did not portend any sea change in Irish historiography, as virtually every essay in the collection looked at the Irish in a single town or city. ... [T]he Lansdowne immigrants' story demonstrates the value of tracing the lives of famine-era immigrants back to Ireland, adding a transatlantic perspective that has generally been lacking in the field of immigration history" [From the article, pars. 9 and 68].

"David Armitage arrestingly opens his essay 'The Scottish Diaspora' with the mediaeval French proverb, 'rats, lice and Scotsmen: you find them the whole world over'. Notwithstanding the fact that Scots, surrounded by water on three sides, have always voyaged abroad, it is only in recent years that the socio-historic phenomenon of 'diaspora' has been the subject of serious critical study. Armitage reminds us that 'Scotland's history is a transnational history because the Scots have been such a prominently international people, with an estimated 25 million people of Scottish descent living outside Scotland'. Scottish migration and Scottish migrants are no less a part of Scottish history and 'no history of Scotland could be complete without an account of the Scottish diaspora'. Armitage's chapter is rich in detail, and when discussing migration he does acknowledge that poverty and want caused Scots to migrate in large numbers in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, though he also offers other factors which have accounted for the 'diasporic tendencies' of the Scots from earlier times" [From the review by Michael Lister in *Textualities: Online Literary Magazine*, http://www.textualities.net/writers/non-fiction-reviews/listerm09.php, accessed 23 May 2007).


"This is a first-rate book on the important and fascinating subject of transatlantic connections and the close connections between Glasgow and the United States in particular. This close connection between these two different parts of the world has existed for almost three centuries. Aspinwall's purpose is to suggest that between 1820 and 1920 this relationship had a peculiar intensity, far stronger than before or since. During that period Glasgow and America found certain common interests and pursuits from which each derived substantial advantages. According to Aspinwall, those qualities went far beyond mere economic interest or selfish concern. Glasgow and the United States were members of a tightly knit family, held together by economic interests but even more by common cultural assumptions" [From the review by Vincent P. DeSantis in *The Review of Politics*, 47 (1985), 157-158].


"This volume contains a selection of work by contributors to a conference on the Irish Diaspora organized by the Irish Centre for Migration Studies at University College Cork in 1997. Between them, the seventeen contributors offer a broad chronological and geographical perspective on the experience of Irish migrants worldwide, from India and Argentina to Britain and America, from the eighteenth century through to the 1990s. In such a wide-ranging volume it is little surprise to find that one of the main themes to emerge is that of diversity within the Irish diaspora. To their credit, those involved have also succeeded in producing a focused book in which the key question of 'oppression history' and Irish exceptionalism is given centre stage. ... But this book does more than just rehearse current historiographical debates on Irish immigration. It also points the way for new developments in the field. ... Models for international comparative studies are set out by Malcolm Campbell and Enda Delaney in their chapters on Irish rural settlement
in Minnesota and New South Wales and post-war Irish migration to Britain in a European perspective. Such transnational comparisons are entirely appropriate in a book which favours the use of the word 'diaspora' for its 'less territorially bounded' emphasis on the study of the migrants and their cultures. This unrestricted, inclusive approach may well provide a lead for future studies to follow" [From the review by Louise Miskell in History, 87 (2002), 107-108].

Boyle, Mark, 'Towards a (Re)Theorisation of the Historical Geography of Nationalism in Diasporas: The Irish Diaspora as an Exemplar', International Journal of Population Geography, 7 (2001), 429-446.

"The strength of diasporic nationalism is characterised by an uneven historical geography, with different diasporic communities functioning as 'hotbeds' of nationalism at different times. Mapping and explaining these historical geographies is of importance if the cultural and political experiences of diasporic existence are to be understood. ... Based upon a reading of social scientific literature on the intensity of national affiliation among the nineteenth and early twentieth century Irish diaspora ... the paper advances a case for a (re)theorisation of the phenomenon of diasporic nationalism" [From the article abstract, http://www3.interscience.wiley.com/chi-bin/abstract/90010539/ABSTRACT, accessed 2 September 2007].


"The backgrounds and experiences of Irish immigrants in California in the second half of the nineteenth century differed significantly from those of their compatriots who settled in the northeastern United States. ... This article compares the Irish experience in California with that in the mainland eastern Australian colonies as a first step in a wider examination of the Irish Diaspora in the Pacific. It contends that subnational comparison of the immigrants' experiences on both sides of the Pacific provides a much-needed antidote to the constraints of national narratives of the Irish immigrant experience, bringing more sharply into focus the distinctive features of Irish life in the two Pacific Coast societies" [From 'In This Issue', PHR, 71 (2002)].


"In 1883 John Edward Redmond, future leader of the Irish Parliamentary Party, toured the Australasian colonies on behalf of the Irish National League. ... This article traces Redmond's visit to the colonies, from the discord that marked the opening stages of the mission through to the more amenable atmosphere at the time of his departure, and demonstrates how the 1883 tour significantly affected Redmond's experience of the British empire and his vision for Ireland's future" [From the article abstract, http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1468-229X.00194, accessed 2 September 2007].

"This article will draw upon recent scholarship on the Irish in Australia in order to highlight some of the stark differences between interpretations of Irish experience there and in the United States. It will assess the implications of the Australian example for the existing scholarship on the Irish in the United States and argue the need for the greater receptivity among United States scholars to the findings of studies of the Irish abroad than has hitherto been evident in the field. Finally, the article will explore some possible reasons why recent scholarship on the Irish has failed to challenge the existing tenets of Irish-American scholarship" [From the article, p. 4].


"*The Wearing of the Green* examines competing representations and divergent experiences of St Patrick's Day and deploys 17 March as an explanatory framework - a lens - through which to explore key aspects of the Irish and diaspora history. ... The book adopts a broad geographical canvass for its exploration, including the cities of Dublin, Belfast, New York, Boston, Chicago, London, Liverpool, Sydney, Melbourne, Toronto, Montreal and Quebec. ... The book's wide readership will experience a highly enjoyable and informative socio-historical account of a shift from a closed mono-cultural sense of Irishness to that of Irishness as a diasporic identity, marked by social openness, expansion and cultural enrichment" [From the review by Liviu Popoviciu and Mairtin Mac an Ghaill in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 26 (2003), 777-778].


"Tom Devine has written a masterly survey of relationships between Scotland and the outside world over two formative centuries. He touches subjects long familiar in romantic as well as historical literature, where our understanding has been transformed during the last half century - not least by the researches of Devine himself, and of scholars associated with the Research Institute of Irish and Scottish Studies in Aberdeen University. ... In his short concluding chapter on 'Identities', Devine concludes that through the Empire 'Scottish nationhood was reasserted and embellished [without] threat to Scottish identity' (p. 353). But this case has been only half-sustained. During the last two centuries the nature of the empire itself has been in continuous change. ... Perhaps the most important chapters in the history of Scotland's empire, with even wider implications for Scottish identity, remain to be written" [From the review by John D. Hargreaves in the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, 32 (2004), 145-146].


"It is a matter for celebration that Irish-Australian studies have come of age in time for the country's bicentennial. In this study, I wish to review the pertinent literature, and compare its themes, assumptions and methods with those of Irish-American studies. Since the Irish Australianists do not always fully understand the American-Irish experience (though they frequently use it), I shall set their readings against my own, and stress the common elements in the two experiences, rather than the differences. I shall conclude with an examination of the Catholicism of the Famine emigrants in the United
States, and suggest some of its implications for the Australian pattern" [From the article, p. 73].


"Irish migration to Canada is now the subject of a rich literature. It ranges from broad statistical studies of origins, flows and immigrant distributions to detailed investigations of adaptations in specific settings. Scholars have examined the process either from the perspective of emigrants departing Ireland or immigrants adjusting to a new environment. This book seeks to integrate these two perspectives. It traces first the movement across the Atlantic and then migration over two generations of settlement in Canada. This approach may not be new to students of, for example, Scandinavian settlement in the American midwest, but there is no study yet in Canada that links European immigration, settlement and subsequent internal migrations in such detail" [From the review by John Mannion in the *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 79 (1989), 469-479].


"Among the many strengths of this well-written work is the admirable treatment of Irish immigration as a phenomenon involving events at the area of origin, on the journey, and in Butte - which was the major way station in a network of western mining camps and the only one that ever became an industrial city. The Irish emigration over the half century after 1875, according to Emmons, was the result of the continuing deindustrialization of Southern Ireland, changes in landholding and family practices accompanied by a commensurate decline in resources available for inheritance and dowries" [From the review by Patrick J. Blessing in the *Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 22 (1992), 752-754].


"Given its enormous scale and long history, the scattering of the Irish has obvious attractions for ethnic scholars with a diasporic bent. Foremost among them are Donald Akenson and Malcolm Campbell, who have challenged Irish studies scholars - particularly those in the US - to take a comparative approach to the Hibernian diaspora. *New Perspectives on the Irish Diaspora* rises to the challenge with scholarly essays and creative writing on a range of diasporic subjects, including Eamonn Wall's poems about emigrating from Ireland to America and Lawrence McBride's essay on the letters of the Reynoldses, Irish emigrants whose members met very different fates in England and the US. Yet the contributors' commitment to the diasporic perspective is by no means unanimous. In an essay that responds to Akenson, historian Lawrence McCaffrey offers several points of contrast between the Irish in America and in other lands. ... Although he acknowledges the importance of such comparisons, he rejects Akenson's suggestion that they be a priority for US scholars of the Irish. Instead, McCaffrey urges American scholars to sort out 'the complexity of their own area of study' (p. 21) by exploring the regional and gender differences of Irish-American culture and studying 'Catholicism as culture and
ethnicity' (p. 25). ... On the other hand, several of the pieces in New Perspectives on the Irish Diaspora make excellent use of transnational comparison" [From the review by Bluford Adams in American Literary History, 15 (2003), 395-408].

Fitzpatrick, David, 'Exporting Brotherhood: Orangeism in South Australia', Immigrants and Minorities, 23 (2005), 277-310.

"The idea of fraternity, and how to organise it, was one of nineteenth-century Europe's invisible exports to the New World. This paper explores the international diffusion of the Loyal Orange Institution, with comparative reference to Freemasonry, its main model. Three alternative explanations are discussed for its appeal outside Ireland (that it facilitated the assimilation of emigrants, transmitted 'tribal' Irish animosities to fresh contexts, or adapted itself to pre-existing sectarian rivalries abroad). These hypotheses are tested using evidence from South Australia, where Orangeism flourished in the absence of heavy Ulster immigration. ..." [From the article abstract, http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/routledg/fimm/2005/00000023/F0020002/art00008;jsessionid=5c11mab7t48.alice, accessed on 2 September 2007].


"... this book provides two interesting but ultimately contradictory approaches to the idea of Irish history in New Zealand. The two opening chapters by Donald Harman Akenson and Patrick O'Farrell are think pieces on the nature of Irish history. They provide a platform for re-thinking the nature of Irishness in a study of New Zealand society and beyond. They argue that the Irish diaspora is complex and old stereotypes need to be avoided. It is necessary to demonstrate, for instance, the extent to which Irish migrants contributed to the growth of empire and not just formed pockets of resistance against it, to look at the nature of the expansion of Ireland alongside that of the diaspora of Spanish and African peoples and to look at the interaction between the two. ... If these two chapters set a framework for looking at the Irish experience, it is a framework that the rest of the book largely ignores" [From the review by Michael Belgrave in the New Zealand Journal of History, 37 (2003), 102-103].


"Quite the most remarkable achievement of nineteenth-century Ireland was the creation of an international Catholic Church throughout the Celtic diaspora in the British Empire and North America. ... One conclusion, however, is clear from the many recent studies of the Irish in modern Ireland, England, Scotland, America and Australia, and on Irish, English, Scottish, American and Australian Roman Catholic history: that the subject has a unity conferred by the fusion of religious, national and ethnic identity in the international consciousness of the Irish Catholic emigrant, who was aware through his newspapers, parochial organizations and political parties of what was happening in Ireland and throughout the Irish diaspora, and who was therefore part of an international community pervaded by the nationalist movements and by the Roman Catholic Church" [From the article, p. 188, 189].

"One of the most exciting and significant themes in Irish immigrant history has been the importance of local, regional, and even national variations in the experiences of the Irish living in the many countries of what has been called the Irish Diaspora. Over the last thirty years, for example, historians have argued that Irish immigrants fared significantly better in the favorable environments of the American Far West and Midwest or even in Canada and Australia than they did in Boston, the rest of New England, or New York City. Dr. David T. Gleeson’s book builds on this previous work as it sets out to explore the question of how and why Irish immigrant experiences in the nineteenth-century American South also differed from those in the Northeast. Gleeson asserts that ‘native tolerance’ of the Irish in the South was one critical reason for such differences (p. 192). He cites several possible reasons for such tolerance, but the most significant and intriguing of them center on the Irish immigrants’ enthusiastic endorsement of slavery and white supremacy, which allayed southern natives’ suspicions of Irish commitments to Catholicism or to Irish nationalism" [From the review by Timothy J. Meagher in *The Journal of American History*, 90 (2003), 227-228].


"In this book Breda Gray analyses issues of identity and belonging among Irish women who migrated to London and Luton in the 1980s. However, this is not simply a book about migrants. Using focus groups, Gray carried out extensive research in both Ireland and Britain collecting the view of Irish women in Britain and Ireland. Her focus groups in Ireland included women who had returned to live in Ireland after a period of migration in Britain. For a study about diaspora, Gray took the unusual approach of also interviewing women who had remained in Ireland and chosen not to emigrate. By so doing, Gray is able to explore the tensions between emigrants, returned emigrants and non-emigrants. ... Gray locates her study within the context of recent theorization of diaspora and debates about diasporic identities in Ireland. In the 1990s several Irish commentators, including the former President of Ireland Mary Robinson, began to talk about the Irish diaspora and the need for an Irishness that included the rich diversity of Irish experiences. Gray neatly juxtaposes this celebratory ideal against the on-going political reluctance to enfranchise Irish citizens living abroad" [From the review by Louise Ryan in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28 (2005), 191-192].


"Griffin’s book is so successful because he understands that the historian of any diaspora has a dual responsibility: to the homeland and to the new land. Privileging either of these distorts the picture. Thus, he gives nearly half of his study to dealing with the Ulster Scots on their own ground: not as Americans in waiting but as members of an Irish culture that had an integrity of its own, and one that maintained its character even with the migrants gone. ... Moreover, Griffin is admirably sensitive to and respectful of the protean identity of these people. He does not use apodictic categories of nationality—Scottish, Irish—to categorize them. Instead, he shows that they had multiple identities
both in the homeland and in America, and that the kaleidoscope of these identities rotated frequently. Finally, this book works so well because Griffin is not afraid to deal with religion as an agent and reagent of ethnic identity. His story on the American frontier is especially fascinating, for he gives us the first part of the story of how the Ulster Presbyterians eventually became the spine of the Southern Baptists” [From the review by Donald Harman Akenson in the American Historical Review, 107(2002), 1190-1191].


"As a contribution to Scottish history this is an important work. It underlines the role of the empire, not least as a focus for, and encouragement of, overseas activity, but also does so by redressing the balance toward the Caribbean and away from a total focus on North America. … Another source of value comes from the timespan. Far from producing a static concept of the empire, this is a book that successfully engages with the nature, dynamics and implications of change. An analysis of Scotland leads Hamilton to argue that the Scots who went to the Caribbean came from distinctive social and gender groups. Caribbean travellers were young single males, rather than family groups. They were also more affluent than the emigrants to the northern colonies, and therefore not driven by hardship. Far from intending to settle in the Caribbean, many sought economic knowledge and benefit before returning home. The profits they made were to be re-invested in Scottish land and industry, fuelling the processes of change in Scotland. … Politics is shown to have spanned the Atlantic, colonial patronage and power being related to pre-existing kinship connections in Scotland” [From the review by Jeremy Black in the Journal for Maritime Research, September 2005, http://www.jmr.nmm.ac.uk/server/show/ConJmrBookReview.123, accessed 2 September 2007].


"The fifteen essays in this volume are drawn from a 1996 conference in Halifax that examined popular perceptions of historical connections between Scotland and Nova Scotia. As the editors explain in their preface, the conference itself, and the resulting book, have attempted to build on this central theme by encouraging a wider range of related scholarly inquiry, and by promoting a more diverse discussion among practitioners of different disciplines, into links between the two places. The book succeeds in addressing those challenges. … Although much of the evidence presented deals with Nova Scotia and the Maritime provinces, immigration to the rest of Canada, the United States, Australia, and New Zealand figures prominently in several essays. That being the case, students of immigration will find a wider variety of case studies here than the title actually suggests” [From the review by Andrew D. Nicholls in The Scottish Historical Review, 82 (2003), 157-158].

"The examination of transatlantic ties has held a long attraction for scholars. In the context of Scottish relations with colonial America, attention was focused on distinct areas where Scots made an impact on the development of America, with clear boundaries established between 'Scots' and 'America'. More recent developments have examined elements within the British Empire through a larger common interaction, placing regions such as Scotland, America, and England together in order to discover their continuing influence on each other. The result has been a heightened realization of these regions as distinct parts, yet existing within a transatlantic community, a greater polity which requires further examination. One method is to consider a wider context of events normally treated as developments specific to given regions of the British Empire. The Jacobite Rebellion of 1745-46, or the '45, serves admirably. ... The '45 therefore helps to develop a greater understanding of the larger British polity of the mid-eighteenth century, and of the strong sense of transatlantic identity and loyalty felt by the various groups within it" [From the article, p. 24-25].


"In this paper the political fortunes and identities of Irish Catholics in US and Canadian cities are explored through a comparative study of Buffalo and Toronto. Local spaces of political administration in the urban arena, such as wards, were significant in affecting the generation of sociopolitical networks of power which in turn had implications for the sense of political identity and involvement felt by Irish Catholics within these two places. The importance of such spaces, however, was also contingent on the interaction between these cities' Irish Catholic populations and wider geographies of social, economic, and ethnoreligious relations over time as well as on the topographies and traditions of political power that extended beyond the municipal scale in both societies" [From the article abstract, http://www.envplan.com/abstract.cgi?id=d21s, accessed on 2 September 2007].


"With a view to contributing to recent calls for the integration of comparative and transnational perspectives in Irish migration history, this essay describes various networks established within Irish communities in two North American cities from 1870 to 1910, and explores their role in personal and group identity formation in particular. Case studies from Buffalo and Toronto are used to underscore the importance of spatial, as well as historical, contingency in appreciating the geographies of not simply one, but several, interrelated Irish diasporas. ..." [From the article abstract, http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/routledg/fimm/2005/00000023/F0020002/art00011, accessed on 2 September 2007].


"Not all immigrants to Britain's far-flung overseas empire intended to become permanent settlers. These transients, or 'sojourners', were to be found in many places: at Hudson
Bay, in India, in the Caribbean, and in the tobacco colonies of Chesapeake Bay. This book attempts to correct this deficiency by studying two groups of sojourners in the eighteenth century: Scots migrants to Jamaica and to the Chesapeake area. In addition to offering a contribution to immigration and ethnic history, Alan L. Karras provides an analysis based on a transatlantic perspective, emphasizing the linkages between Scotland and two groups of staple colonies that are increasingly seen as having much in common. This complex combination of unusual perspectives is undoubtedly the work's greatest strength” [From the review by J.M. Bumsted in The Journal of American History, 81 (1994), 653].


"How do immigration and ethnicity fit into the recent efforts of American historians to write transnational history? Surveying studies of Irish immigration, Kevin Kenny evaluates current scholarly efforts to put migration in global context. Diasporic approaches examine the movement of people, capital, and ideas across national and regional boundaries, and they highlight reciprocal interactions and a common sensibility in a globally scattered population. But the concept of diaspora obscures the emergence in countries of settlement of nationally specific ethnicities that differentiate an ostensibly unitary people, be they Irish, Italian, or African. Understanding American immigration and ethnicity in global context thus requires a powerful and flexible framework of inquiry that combines both cross-national comparison and diasporic history" [From 'Previews', JAH, 90 (2003)].


"The fifteen essays in this fine collection are organized into four sections: 'Patterns of Migration', 'Politics and Race', 'The World of Work', and 'Representation, Memory and Return'. ... While conceding that 'new' historiography rarely represents an abrupt departure from existing scholarship, Kenny suggests that recent research in Irish American history has at least three claims to originality: following broader trends in the field of American history, its focus is increasingly 'transnational'; it integrates the Protestant migration of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries; and it incorporates new themes of race, class, and gender” [From the review by Kathleen Sprows Cummings in the Journal of American Ethnic History, 23 (2004), 114-115].


"The type of history I write and teach is best called 'transatlantic'. It deals with Irish history in both Ireland and North America simultaneously, examining patterns of migration, of cultural continuity and change, and of economic and political interaction. My first attempt to write this sort of history was a doctoral dissertation in U.S. history called 'Making Sense of the Molly Maguires', which eventually became a book of the same name. On one level, the approach was quite narrow, telling the story of a group of Irish mine workers in Pennsylvania in the 1860s and 1870s, twenty of whom were hanged for sixteen murders committed, according to the authorities, as part of a conspiracy imported
directly from Ireland. On another level, the approach was very broad, for the story contained at its heart the principal themes in both Irish and Irish-American history in the mid-nineteenth century: land, famine, and emigration on the Irish side and, on the American, industrialization, the Civil War, and immigration. The actions of the 'Molly Maguries' in Pennsylvania, it became clear, would make little sense unless they were placed in an Irish as well as an American context” [Kevin Kenny, “Author's response”, http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/articles/kennyKevin.html, accessed 20 April 2007].


"The extent, nature and consequences of Scotland's early modern overseas expansion has attracted considerable attention of late, and this handsomely produced volume is thus to be welcomed. Divided into two thematic sections ('Structures of Imperial Involvement: Commerce and Settlement', and 'Cultural Connections and Provincial Intellects'), it consists of nine chapters as well as an introduction. ... Far from generating the impression of mere linear exchanges between 'old world' Scotland and 'new', underdeveloped North America, a far more negotiated and ambiguous picture emerges. ... All in all, this is a useful volume that deepens our understanding of the sheer complexity of Scottish contact with the Americas" [From the review by Andrew MacKillop in The Scottish Historical Review, 83 (2004), 100-102].


"This study seeks to explore transnational communication among migrants of the Irish diaspora through an examination of the Orange Order's networks. It draws upon rare local and district records and press accounts to explain the migratory links and social worlds of Orange emigrants from Ulster. ... It demonstrates how Orangemen in Ireland came to recognise the diasporic dimension of their movement, and how members used the Order to negotiate some of the pathways of migration that were an important feature of their lives, and in the lives of the working class more generally” [From the article abstract, http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/routledg/fimm/2005/00000023/F0020002/art00009;jsessionid=6i7kuibrj4i9.alice, accessed on 3 September 2007].

MacRaild, Donald M., 'Crossing Migrant Frontiers: Comparative Reflections on Irish Migrants in Britain and the United States during the Nineteenth Century', Immigrants and Minorities, 18 (1999), 40-70.

"This essay examines some of the most important comparative issues in the study of the Irish in Britain and America. While noting key differences in the size, timing and nature of these two migrant flows, it also suggests core points of similarity. It is argued that Irish migrants had to negotiate numerous frontiers in order to achieve successful or contented lives in the new communities. These included the economic frontiers of workplace and of housing; the social frontier of community building; the political frontier of ethnic group achievement; and, of course, the psychological frontiers of native hostility and anti-immigrant violence. ... The essay...draws on recent research on the concepts of race, class
and ethnicity to delineate points of comparison and divergence of the history of the Irish Diaspora during the long nineteenth century" [From the article abstract].


"Almost a decade has elapsed since Graham Davis produced *The Irish in Britain, 1815-1914* (Dublin, 1991), the first major synthesis of research on the experiences of Irish migrants in Victorian and Edwardian Britain, and Dr MacRaild's study, which not only takes cognizance of the considerable body of research which has occurred during the 1990s, but also places the study of the Irish in Britain within the wider context of the Irish diaspora, is both a timely and a worthy successor to Davis's earlier work" [From the review by Roger Swift in *The English Historical Review*, 115 (2005), 1331].

"The practice of viewing the Irish experience in Britain within the context of the wider Irish diaspora, as advocated by Donald Akenson, is to be applauded but it could be taken a stage further. It is important to recognize that the British saw Irish migrants through a cultural filter that depicted them as constituting a social problem, whatever their economic value. By contrast, in North and South America, Australia, and South Africa, within a generation or two of their arrival, Irish migrants were seen in a positive light as nation builders. ... Perhaps what is most pertinent is the very diversity of experience that Irish migrants encountered in Britain" [From the review by Graham Davis in *The Economic History Review, N.S.* , 53 (2000), 363-364].


"The relations between Britain, the United States and Brazil have been the source of studies based mainly on the contribution that the immigrants made to the host country. Marshall's book, however, does not follow this pattern. Its strength lies in the fact that it focuses on a triangular migration flow: emigration, return migration (mainly 'failed' returnees) and re-emigration to a second or third country" [From the review by Laura P.Z. Izarra in the *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 38 (2006), 903-904].

"Oliver Marshall's book is an important contribution to the study of British and Irish diasporas, and to the research of migrations in Latin America. Its strongest points are its inclusive perspective that covers English, Irish and Irish-American migrants - a point of view frequently absent from often narrowly focused Irish historiography" [From the review by Edmundo Murray in *Irish Migration Studies in Latin America*, 4 (2006), 181-184].


"The contributors to this collection employ a fresh approach to the subject of Scottish migration through an examination of personal testimony and emigrant correspondence. Use of these sources to establish the changing identities of migrants and the formal and informal networks that Scots constructed and drew on, first to undertake emigration and second to establish themselves in their new countries, is the unifying theme of the book."
Organized in chronological order, it does not provide systematic coverage of Scottish migration across three centuries. Instead, the movement of Scots, or case studies of individuals, are examined for selected time periods to specific destinations; India and the Caribbean in the eighteenth century, Australia and New Zealand in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and chapters on North America covering all three centuries" [From the review by Karen Cullen in The Journal of British Studies, 46 (2007), 188-189].


"McCarthy paints a richly detailed picture of the ways that Irish people responded to the rapidly changing circumstances they encountered in their everyday lives and how they adapted certain Old World cultural resources to survive in a new environment. We may quibble with some aspects of the interpretation. But these objections are easily outweighed by the book’s accomplishments. First and foremost, McCarthy has answered recent calls for transnational and comparative approaches to Irish global migration. She succeeds in capturing movements and interactions across national boundaries and breaks down the ‘salt-water curtain’ (p. 5) that so often hinders work in the field. The methods developed and refined in her work shed new light on critical issues in migration history and provide a ‘nuanced explanation’ (p. 264) of Irish mobility. This book is ... a major contribution to the expanding literature in Irish diaspora studies. It is also instructive for New Zealand scholars seeking to recover migrant experiences in local social settings. As McCarthy makes quite clear, we must know the world outside to write this country’s migration and ethnic history. ... One hopes that this important book spurs exciting new research that transcends the limitations of a national focus and attends to the fluidity and dynamism of transnational interactions" [From the review by Lyndon Fraser in the Journal of British Studies, 45 (2006), 924-925.]


"McLean’s argument is embedded in a history of the Highland emigration to Glengarry County in Canada. Using an abundance of local records from Glengarry and from the shire of Inverness, McLean examines the histories of several of the principal Scottish estates that sent settlers to Glengarry, recreates what she can of emigrant departures over a period of half a century, and describes the process of settlement in Canada. ... The strength of *The People of Glengarry* is that its arguments are firmly grounded in the sources on both sides of the Atlantic. The Scottish sources could be used even more. Because she restricts her focus to those who actually emigrated to Glengarry, McLean pays little attention to those who stayed behind. ... Setting the emigrants’ story against even the outline of the fate of those who did not venture to North America would provide a much firmer basis for assessing the role of that emigration in the Highland experience of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries" [From the review by Ned Landsman in the Journal of Interdisciplinary History, 24 (1993), 191-192].


"Kerby Miller’s book is the result of fifteen years of research and writing. An impressive
work, it offers the first major interpretation of the Irish immigrant experience in North America. ... Miller has not only mined every significant archive in the United States and Canada, but in Ireland as well. This is what makes his study unique. It is a transatlantic history of Irish emigration based on sources both in North America and Ireland. ... Miller states his thesis very clearly - 'the homesickness, alienation, and nationalism were rooted ultimately in a traditional Irish Catholic world view which predisposed Irish emigrants to perceive or at least justify themselves not as voluntary, ambitious emigrants but as involuntary nonresponsible "exiles", compelled to leave home by forces beyond individual control, particularly by British and landlord oppression' (p. 566)" [From the review by Jay P. Dolan in the *International Migration Review*, 21 (1987), 175-177].


"... [T]he theorizing of nationalism often remains safely corralled within the territorial boundaries of [the] ... nation-state. In order to advance theoretical understandings of nationalism, it is imperative that geographers break this sedentary spell. This paper seeks to do just that, through analysis of a particularly vehement brand of nineteenth-century Irish nationalism known as Fenianism, and by revealing the crucial role that the Irish diaspora played in the transatlantic development of Irish nationalism" [From the article abstract, p. 439].

O'Day, Alan, 'Imagined Irish Communities: Networks of Social Communication of the Irish Diaspora in the United States and Britain in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries', *Immigrants and Minorities*, 23 (2005), 399-424.

"The discussion in this essay clarifies three neglected aspects of the comparative destinies of the Irish in America and Great Britain. First, it explores an apparent if generally unrecognised discrepancy between theories of nationalism and those of ethnicity, attempting to close a loophole in the literature. Secondly, it assesses what being Irish meant to the networks bridging the diasporic experience in the old country and adopted lands. Thirdly, it looks at tours overseas, mainly to the United States, by nationalist figures from the vantage point of the formation of an imagined community or network. It is suggested that the disjunction and a degree of misunderstanding about the networking process arises because the literature presumes an already existing or nearly formed Irish Catholic identity among the immigrants on arrival in new lands. ..." [From the article abstract, http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/routledg/fimm/2005/00000023/F0020002/art00012, accessed 2 September 2007].


"Comparative approaches to Irish migration have clearly shaped some of the best writings in the field. One of the most important of these contributions in recent times in Patrick O'Sullivan's magisterial six-volume collection of essays, *The Irish World-Wide*. Bringing together dozens of scholars from across the world (the authorship as well as the content is Diasporic), O'Sullivan's collection is one of the most comprehensive surveys of Irish migration and communities hitherto attempted. Although few of the individual
essays are explicitly comparative, reading each volume cannot but encourage the reader to think comparatively. In methodological terms, this is not strictly comparative history, but far broader in scope, and more holistically comparative, than most other works. O'Sullivan's collection illustrates quite clearly the common themes that emerge and re-emerge as the Irish migrant's story is placed on the broad canvas it requires" [From Donald M. MacRaild, "Crossing Migrant Frontiers: Comparative Reflections on Irish Migrants in Britain and the United States during the Nineteenth Century", in The Great Famine and Beyond: Irish Migrants in Britain in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries, ed. by D.M. MacRaild, (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2000), p. 45].

Patterson, Brad, ed., Ulster-New Zealand Migration and Cultural Transfers, (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2006).

"Patterson's work on the Irish in New Zealand offers a timely reminder that historians in that part of the world are determined to catch up with those elsewhere. This is good news, for the Ireland-New Zealand story is an important one. In the nineteenth century, Ireland sent a fifth or more of all Europeans who went to New Zealand. With the Scots, they contributed almost half of the total settler population, and Ulster yielded the largest provincial Irish stream. ... The volume has recurring themes, one of which is the impact of Ulster on New Zealand culture, given that Ulster Protestants, unlike Irish Catholics, are thought to have assimilated relatively easily into a wider British imperial world. Another way of looking at this issue of integration is to focus (as Angela McCarthy does) on the persistent ties between Ulster people within New Zealand" [From the review by Donald MacRaild in The English Historical Review, 122 (2007), 267-268].


"Comparative methods allow us to explore how the experiences of nineteenth-century Irish communities varied across Canada. Examination of St. Patrick's Day processions in Montreal and Toronto reveals that those organizing the processions in Montreal were generally more successful at achieving the appearance of community consensus than their counterparts in Toronto. In both cities the parades acted as a catalyst for discussions concerning the balance between lay initiative and clerical authority, the question of loyalty to Canada versus loyalty to Ireland, and the relationship between Protestants and Catholics. Only by exploring the complex interactions of local, national, and international politics in each of the two communities, however, can we understand these different outcomes" [From the article abstract, https://www.library.yorku.ca/ojs/index.php/hssh/article/viewFile/4335/3533, accessed 2 September 2007.


"Irish women have a long history of emigration which provides parallels with the experiences of women now moving to settle in Ireland. In both cases, women migrants have been needed to fill the massive deficit of paid domestic labor in rapidly industrialising economies. Over the last two centuries, these destinations for Irish women
have included the USA, Britain and Australia, as well as Canada, New Zealand, South Africa and Argentina. Some of the complexities in the positioning of migrant Irish women within the 'diaspora spaces' they occupy are explored in this article. ... The concept of diaspora explicitly includes those identifying themselves as Irish over several generations. I use qualitative findings from the Irish 2 Project, a recent study of the large second-generation Irish population in Britain, to examine narratives of women living in Manchester who grew up in "Irish" households and are subsequently negotiating hybrid identities in adulthood. ..." [From the article abstract].